



# External mid-term evaluation mission of the workplace support program in rwanda

## Executive summary

**Evaluation Report**  
20 March 2020

**Fabrice HENARD**  
**L**earning Avenue  
25 rue de l'Abbé Carton  
75014 PARIS – F  
+33 686 174 892  
[www.learningavenue.fr](http://www.learningavenue.fr)

### Table of Contents

**1. TABLE OF ACRONYMS..... 2**

## Table of Acronyms

<b>APEFE</b>	Association pour la Promotion de l'Education et de la Formation à l'Etranger (APEFE)
<b>APPROJUBAR</b>	Association pour la promotion des producteurs de jus, boisson alcoolique et alcoolisées au Rwanda
<b>COVEPAR</b>	Coopérative de valorisation et d'exportations des produits agricoles rwandais
<b>DGD</b>	Direction Générale du développement
<b>EDPRS</b>	Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy.
<b>EDC</b>	Education Development Centre
<b>ENABEL</b>	Belgian Development Agency
<b>ESB</b>	Employment Service Board
<b>ESSP</b>	Education Sector Strategic Plan
<b>GMO</b>	Gender Monitoring Office
<b>GVT</b>	Graduates of Vocational Training
<b>IBI</b>	Imanzi Business Institute of Private Sector Federation
<b>IPRC</b>	Integrated Polytechnic Regional Centre
<b>MIFOTRA</b>	Ministry of Public Service and Labour
<b>MINECOFIN</b>	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
<b>MINEDUC</b>	Ministry of Education
<b>MINICOM</b>	Ministry of Trade and Industry
<b>NCBS/CESB</b>	National Capacity Building Secretariat or Capacity Building and Employment Services Board
<b>NCPD</b>	National Council of Persons with Disabilities
<b>NEP</b>	National Employment Policy
<b>NUDOR</b>	National Union of Disability Organizations of Rwanda,
<b>PAFP</b>	Common Support Program for Vocational Training
<b>PMU</b>	Program Management Unit
<b>PROMOST</b>	Promoting Market Oriented Skills Training and Employment Creation in the Great Lakes Region.
<b>PSF</b>	Private Sector Federation
<b>RDB</b>	Rwanda Development Board
<b>RICEM</b>	Rwanda Institute for Cooperatives, Entrepreneurs and Microfinance
<b>RNUD</b>	Rwanda National Union of the Deaf
<b>RP</b>	Rwanda Polytechnic
<b>SC</b>	Steering Committee
<b>SDG</b>	Sustainable Development goals
<b>TMC</b>	Technical Monitoring Committee
<b>TVET</b>	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
<b>WDA</b>	Workforce Development Authority
<b>WLP</b>	Workplace Learning Policy

# Executive summary

---

## The WPL Support program

The Workplace Support program in Rwanda introduces a vocational training system at the institutional level for students, involving large number of beneficiaries and stakeholders that has taken this project to the national level. This program has its roots in the Workplace Learning (WPL) Policy developed by the Rwandan authorities and approved in 2015.

The APEFE program supporting the Ministry for Public Service and Labour (MIFOTRA) and the Private Sector Federation (PSF) implements the Apprenticeship Training pilot project from 2017-2021. Its ambition is to support Rwandan partners in achieving the operational design of this policy and to pilot it.

The specific outcomes of the Workplace Support Program are: Quality, inclusive and equitable apprenticeship training, accessible to young Rwandan women and men, responding to the skills needs of the growing Rwandan economy, is initiated in the trades of food processing and/or beauty/fashion.

The program has been planned for a duration of 5 years, from 2017 to 2021, for € 3,374,500. It is expected that at the end of the Workplace Learning Support Programme, at least 375 young people, including 153 girls, 45 people living with disabilities, 190 socio- economically disadvantaged persons, will be certified from apprenticeship training<sup>1</sup>.

As of January 2020, the outlook of the activities and targets is the following:

- 121 apprentices graduated since the start of the program;
- 181 apprentices in training for the moment; a significant proportion are vulnerable people or have disabilities.
- 103 In-company instructors trained;
- 25 TVET school teachers trained;
- 12 TVET School managers trained;
- 6 Master Trainers for in-company instructors trained;
- 11 TVET School involved (named pilot schools);
- 152 companies involved.

## Key findings:

After only 2,5 years of operation, there is evidence that the WPL Support Program has not only been a pilot but paved the way to develop a system-wide approach of dual training in Rwanda. The value resides in the program's capacity to foster and bridge the companies' capacities and the apprentices skills.

Dual training has increasingly become a **component of the WPL** Support Program and thus of the TVET model in the country. The learning experience has been shared and partners (APEFE, MIFOTRA and PSF) has incrementally understood how dual training could function at best in Rwanda.

The stakeholders including APEFE, MIFOTRA and PSF as well as professional associations and chambers, have **strengthened their cooperation** on the dual training model (design,

---

<sup>1</sup> Newsletter 2018, <https://www.apefe.org/images/documents/1st%20Issue%20Newsletter%20-%20WPLSP%20in%20Rwanda.pdf>

implementation and follow-up). Most informants have gained a better understanding on the objectives of the dual training and the required commitment (e.g. in-company instructors have a specific responsibility regarding the supervision and the teaching to apprentices).

Companies played their part by welcoming all types of apprentices, including those with fewer opportunities. The program is therefore recognised as **inclusive**.

At ground level, **in-company instructors and TVET teachers** are satisfied with the value of the capacity building activities supported by the program and their value for their own knowledge and professional skills. Companies better aware of the needs to invest the supervision of the apprentice and the need to leverage their production technics in order to provide the apprentice with the right skills.

There is evidence that **apprentices have gained enhanced motivation** in learning and to spend equal learning time at school and at companies. They realized that time spent at company was not observation or practice on machines/equipment only, it was about learning skills as part of the dual training model. New data received in January 2020 showed that apprentices were much more skilled than those who attend 3-years at TVET schools and most passed the examination.

Above all, informants confirmed the **growing awareness** on the necessity for the Rwandan private sector to invest in human capital, as it will pay off in the future for their individual business and for the country as a whole.

This assessment results notably from:

- The in-depth preparation of the program and the co-management of the program by the 3 stakeholders;
  - The co-management has been tangible, effective and fully embedded by the 3 partners (APEFE, MIFOTRA and PSF). Collaboration has been conducted on the regular basis and breakdown of responsibilities have been clear and respected, and adjusted where necessary.
  - The partners paid attention to trigger the capacity of the local actors to play their part in the implementation of dual training (namely professional associations, chambers, and TVET schools selected).
  - Planning and programming were key in the smooth implementation of the program.
- The good understanding of the Theory of Change by the 3 partners – although it requires to be revised as to fully reflect the specificities of the dual training. The specificities are listed below:
  - **Equipment:** TVET schools and companies should have the right professional and learning environment for dual training;
  - **Pedagogical and professional training.** TVET teachers and in-company instructors should master the training program and have proficient teaching capacities adapted to apprentices (from diverse milieus).
  - **Cooperation between the education and economic sectors.** Cooperation should happen at national level (for curriculum development and interplay on the strategy to implement dual training) and at ground level (to foster interactions between TVET schools and employers).

**There are some challenges** to overcome so that the WPL Support program can reach its specific objectives by 2021 and later.

- **Empowerment** of stakeholders vis-à-vis dual training is on the way. Despite much progress, there is still some confusion from companies and TVET schools amongst the various TVET models. There is actually **diverse understanding of the dual training specificities** by the stakeholders, specifically the TVET schools and companies.
- There are issues regarding the availability and appropriateness of the **equipment** at the companies, which are for some under-equipped to train apprentices efficiently.
- The **cooperation between in-company instructors and TVET teachers** has progressed but will require reinforcement. Enhanced cooperation and knowledge-sharing would be necessary. Likewise, teachers and instructors are freshly trained and struggle to implement the dual training at classroom and company level.
- **Some apprentices (the most deprived or remotely located from companies) struggled to attend the dual training program**, despite scholarships and companies contributed to help them.
- The **absence of legal status of dual training** compromises its expansion and legitimisation from the private sector, as well as from the TVET schools.

There are furthermore **risks to consider** that might hamper ownership as well as the sustainability of the WPL Support program.

- **Risk of misunderstanding of respective pedagogical roles assigned to the TVET schools and to companies.** There is some confusion by employers and TVET schools on their respective role in dual training delivery. Enhanced communication and guidelines are necessary to create a common knowledge on the concept and operationalisation of dual training.
- **Professional associations are not enough structured and staffed to contribute to the revision of curriculum for dual training.** They might not be the right organisations to mobilise on the short term, for this purpose. But they play a key role in disseminating information on dual training to formal and informal private sectors.
- **The 1<sup>st</sup> cohort of apprentices might not find the expected job** they have been hoping for, if they are not further assisted. Likewise, the companies might complain on the low return on profitability of the dual training.

**Three lessons learned have emerged** from the mid-term evaluation:

- **The model relies in the convergence of a solid interplay of different actors**, who are active but who have not gained enough experience specifically on quality assurance, on curriculum development and on interplay between TVET schools and companies. The WPL Support Program has succeeded in trust building among the strategic partners.
- **The dual training model is relevant if implemented with flexibility.** Dual training requires the engagement of companies which don't have the same capacity to train and supervise an apprentice. In Rwanda, the conditions to provide successful dual training are not equally met and calls for flexibility in implementation. Flexibility is key, but should be compensated with **national curriculum framework and adequate quality assurance**, that needs to be operationalized.
- **Development on dual training in Rwanda cannot be disconnected from other WPL models.** The richness of the TVET system lies in the various models, to the extent they are not competing and employers as well as students understand their specificities. A multi-model TVET system allow accommodate more students and offer skills development opportunities that is regulated, leaving the uncertainty of the informal education and training behind. Dual training has its place in the WPL models. The

Rwandan government has recently demonstrated commitment in investing further in TVET and dual training in particular.

<b>Short term recommendations (by 2021):</b>
Enhance communication to general audience on the specificities of dual training compared to other WPL models.
Make sure the equipment is available for apprentices and companies for the upcoming cohorts.
Revise the Theory of change in 2020.
Engage support to the operationalization of the Imanzi Business Institute of PSF to design capacity-building activities to companies.
Further support RP in curriculum design and curriculum development for the 3 sectors.
Increase the frequency of TVET school visits with managers, teachers and companies engaged in the dual training.
Make sure the certificates of competences will be delivered and properly used by the graduates and recruiters.
Support provisions to assist and coach in-company instructors and TVET teachers.
Publish and disseminate the WPL implementation guidelines.

## APEFE Rwanda

### Management response

EXTERNAL MID-TERM EVALUATION MISSION OF THE WORKPLACE SUPPORT PROGRAM IN RWANDA

Date: 9 June 2020

Prepared by:	Position:
Faustin Mwambari	Acting Director General of Labour and Employment, Programme Director, Ministry of Public Service and Labour
Faustin Karasira	Chief Operations Officer, Delegate to co-management, Private Sector Federation
Marie-Pierre Ngoma,	Programme Administrator, APEFE/Rwanda

**Evaluation recommendation 1 : Enhance communication to general audience on the specificities of dual training compared to other WPL models.**

**Management response: partially agree**

#### **Explantations**

Communication about the different WPL models is shared to the general audience as calls for application to attend one or the other WPL model is published when recruitment of students is done. The specificities of dual training are explained in the calls for application for dual training and parents meetings are organized in pilot schools of the programme to explain the dual training system to new cohorts and their parents.

Companies involved in the programme are involved in several training sessions on the implementation of dual training and the support of apprentices in their learning process in the workplace.

Twice a year, printed newsletters also diffuse information on the dual training in addition to quarterly newsletter shared electronically and event based articles are produced whenever an important event takes place.

At strategic level, Implementation Guidelines on the WPL Policy will provide more specificities on each of the types of the workplace learning and how it

should be put into action. The programme supports the organization of knowledge sharing seminars with all actors involved in WPL to share experience, on the implementation of the different types of WPL models that are piloted in Rwanda, successes and challenges.

At the organization level, the programme partners have set up a Knowledge Management Focal Team that will ensure, among others, the collection, documentation and diffusion of information on processes, good practices, challenges in the piloting of dual training.

The tracer surveys will take care of conveying proper information to the informants while collecting the data and sharing the information on the results of dual training in terms of employment.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
1.1 Develop and share brochures explaining the different models of WPL to the general public	June 2020	MIFOTRA, RP, PSF	Data is already available from the different ongoing programmes	initiated
1.2. Share information on the different models of WPL implemented in Rwanda on websites of involved institutions	July 2020	MIFOTRA, RP, PSF	The Knowledge Management Focal Team has an action plan to share about this information	initiated
1.3. Perform a tracer survey to assess the employment opportunities of graduates of dual training compared to other forms of training	September 2020	MIFOTRA, RP, PSF	Terms of reference are ready to be published to recruit a consultant	initiated

**Evaluation recommendation 2 : Make sure the equipment is available for apprentices and companies for the upcoming cohorts.**

Management response: **Agree**

**Explanations**

In 2019, the needed equipment for the training of apprentices in the workplace was identified and distributed.

The identification was coordinated by the chambers and professional associations. This task was not easy as the needs are sector-specific and vary in each company depending on its size. The chambers, professional associations and companies went through a long consultation process to agree on the equipment that can be provided to each company for the training of apprentices.



Equipment was acquired for the trades of tailoring, leather work and fruit processing by end 2019 and the distribution of the equipment started at the beginning of 2020 in companies that are hosting the 2<sup>nd</sup> cohort of apprentices. In 2020, equipment for bakeries will be acquired.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
2.1 Finalise the distribution of acquired equipment to companies	June 2020	PSF, MIFOTRA, APEFE	The distribution started but was interrupted by the COVID-19 lockdown	Initiated
2.2 Acquire equipment for bakery	July 2020	APEFE, MIFOTRA, PSF	A needs assessment was carried out and a tender document is being prepared	initiated

**Evaluation recommendation 3 : Revise the Theory of change in 2020.**

Management response: **Agree**

**Explanations**

The Theory of Change of the programme was developed in 2016. There have since been several changes in the environment, like the creation of Rwanda Polytechnic and the Skills Office at RDB. New strategies were also put in place and have an influence on the implementation of dual training.

The experience of the programme while piloting dual training allowed to better understand the correlation between the different actors and the needs of the system to implement a quality dual training system.

Key action(s)	Completion	Responsible	Tracking
---------------	------------	-------------	----------

	date	unit(s)	Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
2.1 Revise the Theory of Change	August 2020	Technical Monitoring Committee		
<b>Evaluation recommendation 4 : Engage support to the operationalization of the IBI</b>				
Management response: <b>Agree</b>				
<b>Explanations</b>				
<p>The programme started supporting the set up of Imanzi Business Institute in 2019 with technical support to capacitate IBI staff and prepare a business plan for 2020. In 2020, IBI was equipped with a Business Diagnosis software that will allow to identify the capacity needs of the business community and offer services accordingly.</p> <p>The programme supported the development of a training programme and training material for the training of In-company/WPL Instructors. Also, lead trainers of PSF, IBI and RP were capacitated to train In-company/WPL Instructors accordingly.</p>				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
4.1 Support the renovation of IBI building, the acquisition of furniture and IT equipment	November 2020	APEFE, MIFOTRA, PSF	The tender documents for the renovation, supply of furniture and supply of IT Equipment is being prepared	initiated

4.2. Support to PSF for the recruitment of a Managing Director for IBI	June 2020	APEFE, MIFOTRA, PSF	The selection process is initiated by PSF and will be achieved by end of May.	initiated
4.3 Support IBI in developing its e-learning platform	July 2020	APEFE, MIFOTRA, PSF	IBI is being supported in developing its e-learning strategy.	initiated
4.4 Support IBI in developing online training material for the training of in-company instructors and company managers, as well as other stakeholders of WPL	August 2020	APEFE, MIFOTRA, PSF	IBI will be supported to develop online training material for the training of in-company instructors based on the training modules finalised in February 2020, as well as for company managers in business management.	initiated

**Evaluation recommendation 5 : Further support RP in curriculum design and curriculum development for the 3 sectors.**

Management response: **partially agree**

**Explanations**

RP is in charge of the development competency-based curricula, assessment and certification of TVET students, in line with the Rwanda National Qualification Framework (RNQF).

In 2019, the programme supported RP with the development of a level 3 to 5 curriculum for shoe making and the review of the DACUM charts and competency standards for food processing according to the needs of the labour market.

With support of the programme, RP and PSF will collaborate to ensure the review of the food processing curricula according to labour market needs (split training in different trades to specialize learners).

It is planned to support RP with the development of a curriculum for leather goods making (level 3 to 5) and for hairdressing (level 3 to 5), and review the curricula for tailoring.

As curricula are competency-based, all dual training pilot programmes and other workplace learning programmes use the curricula to train, assess and certify students. The trainers and in-company instructors collaborate to design training plans defining the competences to be acquired at school and in the workplace and to assess students. A logbook for apprentices, students in industrial attachment and students in industrial-based learning is available and allows to record all the tasks and learning performed in the workplace, as well as to track their progress. In order to ensure consistency in competency-based assessment and certification of learner, there will be no curricula developed for dual training only.

However, dual training is an opportunity to collect feedback on the existing curricula and inform curriculum review for a better match between training and labour market needs.

In order to ensure quality training, the programme will support RP in developing training material to be used by TVET Trainers, In-company Instructors and students. This material will be useful for school-based training, company-based instruction and distance learning.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
5.1 Develop/review competency-based curricula for the trades of hairdressing, leather goods making, tailoring	June 2021	RP, APEFE	This activity will start in 2020 but due to the long process, finalisation is planned for 2021	initiated
5.2 Develop online training material	November 2021	RP, APEFE	This activity will start in 2020 but due to the long process, finalisation is planned for 2021	initiated
<b>Evaluation recommendation 6 : Increase the frequency of TVET school visits with TVET school teachers and in-company instructors.</b>				
Management response: <b>partially agree</b>				

**Explanations**

During the training of the first cohort of apprentices in 2018-2019, it was observed that visiting apprentices in companies is a challenge for TVET trainers, not only because of the financial cost, but also because companies are far from schools and the lack of time for TVET trainers to visit each and every student frequently while they have other groups of students, who also need to be visited during their industrial attachment.

The formats of monitoring visits plans, monitoring tools and visit reports will be fine-tuned with RP in order to be available for institutionalisation of dual training.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
6.1 Further build the capacities of TVET Trainers on how to plan and implement monitoring visits of apprentices in companies	March 2020	RP, APEFE	The following was achieved: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- a monitoring visits plan for each school team was developed,</li><li>- TVET trainers improved their capacity in using monitoring tools (Logbooks for trainee, TVET &amp; in-company trainers, attendance lists, etc.)</li><li>- a report format capturing the apprentices' performance status versus training plan, their challenges and progress, and the outcome of coaching sessions held between apprentice &amp; in-company instructor</li></ul>	Completed

6.2 Digitalize the monitoring of apprentice’s learning in the workplace to save on expenses and time	July – December 2020	RP, PSF , APEFE	<p>Apprentices and in-company instructors who do not have a smartphone will receive smartphones to ensure a continuous communication with TVET trainers. Each school was already equipped with a laptop, a printer and a modem earlier and will receive a tablet to facilitate communication and filling in digital monitoring forms when visiting apprentices in companies.</p> <p>Apart from using those communication tools to communicate, attend online training, exchange training material and logbooks, the TVET Trainers will use the tablets to enter data, make videos and recording when they visit companies.</p>	Initiated
--	----------------------	-----------------	--	-----------

**Evaluation recommendation 7 : Make sure the certificates of competences will be delivered and properly used by the graduates and recruiters.**

Management response: **Disagree**

**Explanations**

This is already the practice.  
The evaluation and certification process of apprentices is performed by Rwanda Polytechnic in collaboration with PSF. Apprentices receive an official certificate of competence, in line with RTQF which is part of NQF.

Certificates delivered by Rwanda Polytechnic are known by recruiters and are a guarantee of skills acquired.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
<b>Evaluation recommendation 8 : Support provisions to assist and coach in-company instructors and TVET teachers</b>				
<p>Management response: <b>Disagree</b></p> <p><b>Explanations</b></p> <p>This is already the practice.</p> <p>Since the beginning of the programme, training sessions and workshops are organized for TVET trainers and in-company trainers to plan dual training together, reflect on the learning of apprentices in schools and in companies. Moreover, TVET Trainers and in-company trainers meet and discuss the apprentice’s progress during the monitoring visits in companies.</p> <p>A monitoring report format was developed. It has a section to record the outcome of coaching sessions held between apprentice &amp; in-company instructor.</p> <p>Rwanda TVET Trainers Institute (RTTI) is going to be supported to develop content regarding WPL and dual training in the existing curriculum for TVET Trainers and School Managers.</p> <p>A training programme for In-company/WPL instructors was developed and validated in 2019. In-company/WPL instructors will be trained and certified by RP and PSF according to this training programme.</p> <p>The modalities of collaboration between TVET Trainers and in-company instructors have to be established officially based on the experience of the pilot during this programme. Also, an assessment of the cost of this enhanced collaboration and coaching of both TVET Trainers and in-company trainers will be performed to inform MINEDUC for the institutionalization of dual training.</p>				

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
<p><b>Evaluation recommendation 9 : Publish and disseminate the WPL implementation guidelines, and consider :</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. <b>Developing hands-on tools for easy implementation in the company premises and in the class-room.</b></li> <li>b. <b>Documenting the constituents of a functional dual training system in Rwanda, for decision-makers.</b></li> </ul>				
<p>Management response: <b>Agree</b></p> <p><b>Explanations</b></p> <p>The WPL implementation guidelines and the regulatory framework are under development and will be finalised by end of 2020, as this requires a lot of consultation of different actors.</p> <p>Several hands-on tools are already available and the different pilot projects and programmes supported by different development partners worked together in order to harmonise the tools used by TVET trainers and in-company instructors, e.g. the logbooks for the apprentice, for the TVET Trainer and In-company trainers, coaching sessions guidelines and report formats.</p> <p>Moreover, the training material for the In-company/WPL instructors, that was developed according to the validated training programme, contains clear information on what is dual training and how it is implemented.</p>				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible unit(s)	Tracking	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no



				<b>due date)</b>
9.1. Finalise the WPL implementation guidelines and the regulatory framework	November 2020	MIFOTRA	The draft is available but more consultation is required	Initiated
9.2 Developed clear documentation for decision-makers on how the dual training is implemented in Rwanda	August	MIFOTRA, RP, PSF	A Knowledge Management Focal Team with Members from MIFOTRA, PSF, RP, WDA, RDB and APEFE, was set up and already planned actions for 2020. Documenting the implementation of dual training in Rwanda is their task.	Initiated